

CAUSATION AND INSURANCE LAW

OMAR GALICIA
Hermes Sargent Bates, LLP
901 Main Street, Suite 5200
Dallas, Texas 75202
(214) 749-6570
omar.galicia@hsblaw.com

State Bar of Texas
9th ANNUAL
ADVANCED INSURANCE LAW COURSE
April 12-13, 2012
Dallas

CHAPTER 8

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. APPROACHES TO CAUSATION UNDER INSURANCE LAW 1

 A. The Efficient Proximate Cause Doctrine 1

 B. The Concurrent Causation Doctrine 1

 C. Anti-Concurrent Causation Clauses 2

III. CAUSATION TERMINOLOGY: “ARISING OUT OF” AND “RESULTING FROM” 2

IV. CAUSATION AND ADDITIONAL INSURED COVERAGE 5

V. CONCLUSION 6

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Admiral Ins. Co. v. Trident NGL, Inc.</i> , 988 S.W.2d 451 (Tex. App.--Houston [1st Dist.] 1999)	5
<i>All Saints Catholic Church v. United Nat'l Ins. Co.</i> , 257 S.W.3d 800 (Tex. App.--Dallas 2008)	2
<i>Allison v. Fire Ins. Exchange</i> , 98 S.W.3d 227 (Tex. App.--Austin 2002)	2
<i>Allstate Ins. Co. v. Blount</i> , 491 F.3d 903 (8th Cir. 2007)	1
<i>Allstate Ins. Co. v. Smiley</i> , 659 N.E.2d 1345 (Ill. App. Ct. 1995)	3
<i>Allstate Ins. Co. v. Watts</i> , 811 S.W.2d 883 (Tenn. 1991)	2
<i>American Family Mut. Ins. Co. v. Schmitz</i> , 793 N.W.2d 111 (Wis. Ct. App. 2010)	1
<i>American Motorists Ins. Co. v. L-C-A Sales Co.</i> , 713 A.2d 1007 (N.J. 1998)	3
<i>American States Ins. Co. v. Bailey</i> , 133 F.3d 363 (5th Cir. 1998)	3
<i>Amherst Country Club, Inc. v. Harleysville Worcester Ins. Co.</i> , 561 F. Supp.2d 138 (D.N.H. 2008)	2
<i>Bao v. Liberty Mut. Fire Ins. Co.</i> , 535 F. Supp.2d 532 (D. Md. 2008)	2
<i>Blue Bird Body Co. v. Ryder Truck Rental, Inc.</i> , 583 F.2d 717 (5th Cir. 1978)	3
<i>Bowers v. Farmers Ins. Exch.</i> , 991 P.2d 734 (Wash. Ct. App. 2000)	1
<i>Chase v. State Farm Fire and Cas. Co.</i> , 780 A.2d 1123 (D.C. 2001)	2
<i>Duensing v. State Farm Fire and Cas. Co.</i> , 131 P.3d 127 (Okla. Civ. App. 2005)	1
<i>EMCASCOS Ins. Co. v. Am. Int'l Specialty Lines Ins. Co.</i> , 438 F.3d 519 (5th Cir. 2006)	3
<i>Farmers Union Coop. Ins. Co. v. Allied Prop. & Cas. Ins. Co.</i> , 569 N.W.2d 436 (Neb. 1997)	3
<i>Federal Ins. Co. v. Tri-State Ins. Co.</i> , 157 F.3d 800 (10th Cir. 1998)	3
<i>Gilbane Building Co. v. Admiral Insurance Company</i> , 664 F.3d 589 (5th Cir. 2011)	5, 6
<i>Heritage Mut. Ins. Co. v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co.</i> , 657 So.2d 925 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1995)	4
<i>Howell v. State Farm Fire & Cas. Co.</i> , 267 Cal. Rptr. 708 (Cal. Ct. App. 1990)	2
<i>Lancer Ins. Co. v. Garcia Holiday Tours</i> , 345 S.W.3d 50 (Tex. 2011)	4, 5
<i>Leonard v. Nationwide Mut. Ins. Co.</i> , 499 F.3d 419 (5th Cir. 2007)(applying Mississippi law)	2
<i>Lyons v. Miller Cas. Co. of Texas</i> , 866 S.W.2d 597 (Tex. 1993)	2
<i>Markel American Ins. Co. v. Lennar Corp.</i> , 342 S.W.3d 704 (Tex. App.--Houston [14th Dist.] 2011)	2
<i>Mass Transit Admin. v. CSX Transp., Inc.</i> , 708 A.2d 298 (Md. Ct. App. 1998)	3
<i>McCarthy Bros. Co. v. Continental Lloyds Ins. Co.</i> , 7 S.W.3d 725 (Tex. App.--Austin 1999)	5
<i>Meadowbrook, Inc. v. Tower Ins. Co.</i> , 559 N.W.2d 411 (Minn. 1997)	3
<i>Merrimack Sch. Dist. v. Nat'l Sch. Bus Serv., Inc.</i> , 661 A.2d 1197 (N.H. 1995)	3
<i>Mgmt. Group v. RSUI Indem. Co.</i> , 400 Fed. Appx. 938 (5th Cir. 2010)(applying Texas law)	2
<i>Mid-Century Ins. Co. of Texas v. Lindsey</i> , 997 S.W.2d 153 (Tex. 1999)	4
<i>Murray v. State Farm Fire & Cas. Co.</i> , 509 S.E.2d 1 (W. Va. 1998)	1, 2
<i>National Farmers Union Prop. and Cas. Co. v. Western Cas. and Sur. Co.</i> , 577 P.2d 961 (Utah 1978)	3
<i>Ohio Cas. Grp. of Ins. Cos. v. Bakaric</i> , 513 A.2d 462 (Pa. Super. Ct. 1986)	4
<i>Red Ball Motor Freight, Inc. v. Employers Mut. Liability Ins. Co. of Wisconsin</i> , 189 F.2d 374 (5th Cir. 1951)	3, 4
<i>Safeco Ins. Co. of America v. Hirschmann</i> , 773 P.2d 413 (Wash. 1989)	2
<i>Shirley v. Tri-State Ins. Co.</i> , 274 P.2d 386 (Okla. 1954)	1
<i>Siebert v. Wisconsin American Mut. Ins. Co.</i> , 797 N.W.2d 484 (Wis. 2011)	1, 2
<i>St. Paul Fire & Marine Ins. Co. v. Antel Corp.</i> , 899 N.E.2d 1167 (Ill. App. Ct. 2008)	4
<i>State Farm Fire & Cas. Co. v. Erwin</i> , 393 So.2d 996 (Ala. 1981)	3
<i>State Farm Fire & Cas. Co. v. Rodriguez</i> , 88 S.W.3d 313 (Tex. App.--San Antonio 2002)	2
<i>State Farm Fire & Cas. Co. v. Slade</i> , 747 So.2d 293 (Ala. 1999)	2
<i>State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co. v. Flanary</i> , 879 S.W.2d 720 (Mo. Ct. App. 1994)	4
<i>State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co. v. Partridge</i> , 514 P.2d 123 (Cal. 1973)	2
<i>Toll Bridge Auth. v. Aetna Ins. Co.</i> , 773 P.2d 906 (Wash. 1989)	3
<i>Travelers Indem. Co. v. McKillip</i> , 469 S.W.2d 160 (Tex. 1971)	2
<i>United Servs. Auto. Ass'n v. Morgan</i> , 939 P.2d 959 (Kan. Ct. App. 1997)	3
<i>Utica National Ins. Co. of Texas v. American Indem. Co.</i> , 141 S.W.3d 198 (Tex. 2004)	3
<i>Wallis v. United Servs. Auto. Ass'n</i> , 2 S.W.3d 300 (Tex. App.--San Antonio 1999)	2
<i>Warrilow v. Norrell</i> , 791 S.W.2d 515 (Tex. App.--Corpus Christi 1989)	2
<i>Winnacunnet Coop. Sch. Dist. v. National Union Fire Ins. Co.</i> , 84 F.3d 32 (1st Cir. 1996)	3

Statutes

California Insurance Code Section 530..... 2